

## CONCERNING ESSENTIAL CONTINUA OF CONDENSATION\*

BY

R. L. MOORE

A collection  $G$  will be said to be of class 1 if (1) it is an upper semi-continuous collection of mutually exclusive continua, and (2) with respect to its elements it is a continuum with no continuum of condensation.

The subcontinuum  $K$  of the continuum  $M$  is said to be an *essential continuum of condensation* of  $M$  provided it is true that (1)  $K$  is a continuum of condensation of  $M$ , and (2) if  $G$  is a collection of class 1 filling up  $M$ , then some continuum of  $G$  contains  $K$ .

**THEOREM 1.** *If the non-degenerate subcontinuum  $K$  of the compact continuum  $M$  has no continuum of condensation and for every collection  $G$  of class 1 filling up  $M$  there is a continuum of  $G$  that contains  $K$ , then  $K$  is a continuum of condensation of  $M$ .*

**Proof.** Suppose  $K$  is not a continuum of condensation of  $M$ . Then there exists a point set  $D$  which is a domain both with respect to  $M$  and to  $K$ . Since  $K$  has no continuum of condensation,  $D$  contains a free† segment with respect to  $K$ , that is to say, a segment  $t$  of some arc lying in  $K$  such that no point of  $t$  is a limit point of  $K - t$ , in other words, such that  $t$  is a domain with respect to  $K$ . The point set  $t$  is also a domain with respect to  $M$ . If  $M - t$  is a continuum, let  $G$  denote the collection whose elements are  $M - t$  and the points of  $t$ . If  $M - t$  is not connected, it is the sum of two mutually exclusive continua  $g_A$  and  $g_B$  containing the endpoints  $A$  and  $B$  respectively of  $t$ . In this case, let  $G$  denote the collection whose elements are  $g_A$ ,  $g_B$  and the points of  $t$ . In the first case  $G$  is a simple closed curve, and in the second case it is an arc with respect to its elements. In each case it is a collection of class 1 and no continuum of  $G$  contains  $K$ . This involves a contradiction.

**THEOREM 2.** *If  $K$  is a subcontinuum of the compact continuum  $M$ , and for every collection  $G$  of class 1 filling up  $M$  there is a continuum of  $G$  that contains  $K$ , then  $K$  contains a continuum of condensation of  $M$ .*

**Proof.** Suppose  $K$  contains no continuum of condensation of  $M$ . Then it

---

\* Presented to the Society, January 2, 1936; received by the editors August 16, 1936.

† Cf. R. L. Moore, *Foundations of Point Set Theory*, Colloquium Publications of the American Mathematical Society, vol. 13, 1932, p. 144. This book will be referred to as P.S.T.

contains no continuum of condensation of itself. Hence, by Theorem 1,  $K$  is itself a continuum of condensation of  $M$ .

**THEOREM 3.** *If the arc-wise connected continuum  $K$  is a subset of the compact continuum  $M$ , and for every collection  $G$  of class 1 filling up  $M$  there is a continuum of  $G$  that contains  $K$ , then  $K$  contains a continuum of condensation of  $M$  of diameter equal to that of  $K$ .*

Theorem 3 is a consequence of Theorem 1 and the fact that no arc has a continuum of condensation. That it does not remain true on the omission of the stipulation that  $K$  be arc-wise connected may be seen from the following example.

**EXAMPLE 1.** Let  $A, B, C, D$ , and  $E$  denote five points lying on a straight line in the order  $ABCDE$  and such that each of the straight line intervals  $AB, BC, CD$ , and  $DE$  is of length 1. Let  $M_1, M_2$ , and  $M_3$  denote three indecomposable continua of diameter 1 containing the intervals  $BC, CD$ , and  $DE$  respectively and such that no proper subcontinuum of  $M_2$  contains both  $C$  and  $D$ . Let  $M$  denote the point set which is the sum of the interval  $AB$  and the continua  $M_1, M_2$ , and  $M_3$ . If  $G$  is a collection of class 1 filling up  $M$ , some continuum of  $G$  contains the continuum  $M_1 + M_2 + M_3$  and therefore is of diameter not less than 3. But there is no continuum of condensation of  $M$  of diameter as great as 2.

**THEOREM 4.** *If the compact continuum  $M$  has no essential continuum of condensation, then for every non-degenerate subcontinuum  $K$  of  $M$  there exists an upper semi-continuous collection  $G$  of mutually exclusive continua filling up  $M$  such that  $G$  is, with respect to its elements, either an arc or a simple closed curve and such that no continuum of the collection  $G$  contains  $K$ .*

**Proof.** By hypothesis and Theorem 2 there exists a collection  $H$  of class 1 filling up  $M$  and such that no continuum of  $H$  contains  $K$ . Let  $W$  denote the collection whose elements are the continua of the collection  $H$  that intersect  $K$ . There exists a free segment  $t$  with respect to  $H$  such that every element of  $t$  belongs to  $W$ . By an argument analogous to that used in a similar connection in the above proof of Theorem 1, it may be shown that there exists an upper semi-continuous collection  $G$  of mutually exclusive continua filling up  $M$  such that  $G$  is either an arc or a simple closed curve with respect to its elements and such that every element of  $t$  is an element of  $G$ . The continuum  $K$  is not a subset of any continuum of the collection  $G$ .

**NOTATION.** If  $G$  is a collection of point sets, the notation  $G^*$  will be used to denote the sum of all the point sets of the collection  $G$ .

**THEOREM 5.** *If  $M$  is a compact regular curve,  $n$  is a positive integer and, for each  $i$  less than or equal to  $n$ ,  $A_i$  and  $B_i$  are points of  $M$  and  $A_{n+1}$  is a point of*

$M$  and  $B_{n+1}$  is a subset of  $M$  and there exist collections  $H$  and  $K$  of class 1 filling up  $M$  and such that (1) if  $i$  is not greater than  $n$ , no continuum of  $H$  contains both  $A_i$  and  $B_i$ , and (2) the continuum of  $K$  that contains  $A_{n+1}$  contains no point of  $B_{n+1}$ ; then there exists a collection  $G$  of class 1 filling up  $M$  such that, if  $i \leq n+1$ , no continuum of  $G$  intersects both  $A_i$  and  $B_i$ .

**Proof.** For each  $i$  not greater than  $n$  let  $a_i$  denote the continuum of  $H$  containing  $A_i$  and let  $b_i$  denote the one that contains  $B_i$ . Let  $a_{n+1}$  denote the continuum of  $H$  that contains  $A_{n+1}$ . For each  $i$  less than or equal to  $n$ , either  $a_i$  or  $b_i$  is distinct from  $a_{n+1}$ . Let  $L$  denote the set of all continua  $x$  distinct from  $a_{n+1}$  such that, for some  $i$  not more than  $n$ ,  $x$  is identical either with  $a_i$  or with  $b_i$ . There exists a finite set  $T$  of subsets of  $H$  such that (1) each element of  $T$  is a free segment with respect to  $H$ , that is to say, a segment  $t$  of elements of  $H$  such that no element of  $t$  is a limit element of  $H - t$ , (2) the set  $H - T$  is the sum of two mutually separated sets  $W_1$  and  $W_2$  of elements of  $H$  such that  $W_1$  contains  $L$  and  $W_2$  contains  $a_{n+1}$ . There exists a set  $T'$  of points such that (1) each point of the set  $T'$  is an element of  $H$  belonging to some segment of the set  $T$ , (2) for each segment  $t$  of the set  $T$  there is only one point of  $T'$  which is an element of  $t$ . The set  $H - T'$  is the sum of two mutually separated sets  $Q_1$  and  $Q_2$  of elements of  $H$  such that  $W_1$  and  $W_2$  are subsets of  $Q_1$  and  $Q_2$  respectively. For each point  $P$  of the point set  $T' + Q_2^*$  let  $x_P$  denote the continuum of the collection  $K$  that contains  $P$ , and let  $g_P$  denote the component of  $x_P \cdot (T' + Q_2^*)$  that contains  $P$ . Let  $G$  denote the collection whose elements are the elements of  $Q_1$  and the continua  $g_P$  for all points  $P$  of  $T' + Q_2^*$ .

**THEOREM 6.** *If  $M$  is a compact regular curve,  $n$  is a positive integer and, for each  $i$  not greater than  $n$ ,  $A_i$  and  $B_i$  are points of  $M$  and, for each such  $i$ , there exists a collection  $H_i$  of class 1 filling up  $M$  and such that no continuum of  $H_i$  contains both  $A_i$  and  $B_i$ , then there exists a collection  $G$  of class 1 filling up  $M$  such that, if  $i \leq n$ , no continuum of  $G$  contains both  $A_i$  and  $B_i$ .*

**Proof.** Suppose  $m$  is a positive integer for which there exists a collection  $G_m$  of class 1 filling up  $M$  and such that, if  $i \leq m$ , no continuum of  $G_m$  contains both  $A_i$  and  $B_i$ . If  $m < n$  then, by hypothesis and Theorem 5, there exists a collection  $G_{m+1}$  of class 1 filling up  $M$  such that, if  $i \leq m+1$ , no continuum of this collection contains both  $A_i$  and  $B_i$ . The conclusion of Theorem 6 follows by mathematical induction.

**THEOREM 7.** *If  $M$  is a compact regular curve and  $d$  is a positive number and for every collection  $G$  of class 1 filling up  $M$  there is some continuum of  $G$  of diameter greater than or equal to  $d$ , then  $M$  has an essential continuum of condensation of diameter  $d$ .*

**Proof.** Suppose  $n$  is a positive integer such that  $1/n$  is  $< d$ . There exists a finite set  $K$  of points of  $M$  such that every subcontinuum of  $M$  of diameter equal to  $1/(3n)$  contains at least one point of  $K$ . Suppose  $N$  is a subcontinuum of  $M$  of diameter  $d$ . There exist two points  $A$  and  $B$  of  $N$  at a distance apart equal to  $d$ . There exist two subcontinua  $a$  and  $b$  of  $N$  containing  $A$  and  $B$  respectively and each of diameter  $1/3n$ . The continua  $a$  and  $b$  contain points  $A'$  and  $B'$  belonging to  $K$ . The distance from  $A'$  to  $B'$  is greater than  $d - 1/n$ . It follows that there exist finite sequences  $A_1, A_2, \dots, A_j$  and  $B_1, B_2, \dots, B_j$  such that (1) for each  $i$  less than  $j$ ,  $A_i$  and  $B_i$  are points of  $K$  at a distance apart greater than  $d - 1/n$ , and (2) if  $N$  is a subcontinuum of  $M$  of diameter  $d$ , then, for some  $i$ ,  $A_i$  and  $B_i$  are points of  $N$ . Hence, by hypothesis and Theorem 6, there exists a number  $m_n$  such that if  $G$  is any collection of class 1 filling up  $M$ , then some continuum of the collection  $G$  contains both  $A_{m_n}$  and  $B_{m_n}$ . Let  $H$  denote the set of all continua  $h$  such that  $h$  contains both  $A_{m_n}$  and  $B_{m_n}$  and belongs to some collection of class 1 filling up  $M$ . Let  $T$  denote the common part of all the continua of the set  $H$ . Suppose  $T$  contains no continuum that contains both  $A_{m_n}$  and  $B_{m_n}$ . Then  $T$  is the sum of two mutually exclusive closed point sets  $T_A$  and  $T_B$  containing  $A_{m_n}$  and  $B_{m_n}$  respectively. There exists a finite point set  $L$  that separates  $T_A$  from  $T_B$  in  $M$ . Every continuum of the set  $H$  contains both  $A_{m_n}$  and  $B_{m_n}$  and therefore some point of  $L$ . Hence, by Theorem 6, there exists a point of  $L$  that belongs to every continuum of  $H$  and therefore to  $T$ . This is impossible. Hence  $T$  contains a continuum containing both  $A_{m_n}$  and  $B_{m_n}$ . Thus for every positive integer  $n$  there exists a subcontinuum  $K_n$  of  $M$  of diameter greater than  $d - 1/n$  and such that if  $G$  is any collection of class 1 filling up  $M$ , then some continuum of  $G$  contains  $K_n$ . There exists an ascending sequence of positive integers  $n_1, n_2, n_3, \dots$  such that the sequence  $K_{n_1}, K_{n_2}, K_{n_3}, \dots$  has a sequential limiting set  $E$ . The point set  $E$  is a continuous curve of diameter  $d$ . If  $G$  is any collection of class 1 filling up  $M$ , some continuum of  $G$  contains  $E$ . There exist two points  $X$  and  $Y$  belonging to  $E$  and at a distance apart equal to  $d$ . There exists an arc  $XY$  lying in  $E$ . The arc  $XY$  is an essential continuum of condensation of  $M$  of diameter  $d$ .

It is clear from Example 1 that Theorem 7 does not remain true if the requirement that  $M$  be a compact regular curve is replaced by the weaker requirement that it be a compact and webless\* continuum.

---

\* The compact continuum  $M$  is said to be *webless* provided it is true that if  $G_1$  and  $G_2$  are two upper semi-continuous collections of mutually exclusive continua filling up a subcontinuum of  $M$  and such that each of them is an acyclic continuous curve with respect to its elements, then there does not exist an uncountable subcollection  $H$  of  $G_1$  such that no continuum of  $H$  is a subset of any continuum of  $G_2$  (cf. P.S.T., p. 355).

**THEOREM 8.** *If  $M$  is a compact and webless continuum and there exists a positive number  $d$  such that, if  $G$  is any collection of class 1 filling up  $M$ , some continuum of  $G$  is of diameter more than  $d$ , then  $M$  has an essential continuum of condensation.*

**Proof.** Suppose  $M$  has no essential continuum of condensation. Then, by Theorem 36 of page 361 of P.S.T. together with Theorem 2 of the present paper,  $M$  is a regular curve. Hence, by Theorem 7, it has an essential continuum of condensation of diameter  $d$ .

In P.S.T., a subcontinuum  $K$  of a compact continuum  $M$  was called an essential continuum of condensation of  $M$  of type 1 if there exists a non-degenerate subcontinuum  $T$  of  $K$  such that, if  $G$  is a collection of class 1 filling up  $M$ , then some continuum of  $G$  contains  $T$ ; and the subcontinuum  $K$  of  $M$  was called an essential continuum of condensation of  $M$  of type 2 if there exist a point  $P$  of  $K$  and a point  $O$  of  $M$  distinct from  $P$  such that, if  $G$  is a collection of class 1 filling up  $M$ , then  $O$  belongs to the continuum of  $G$  that contains  $P$ . The first of these definitions is open to the objection\* that an essential continuum of condensation of type 1 of a continuum  $M$  is not necessarily a continuum of condensation of  $M$ . However, by Theorem 2, every essential continuum of condensation of type 1 (in the sense of P.S.T.) of a compact continuum  $M$  contains a continuum which is a continuum of condensation of  $M$  and which is therefore an essential continuum of condensation of  $M$  in the sense of the present treatment; and if an essential continuum of condensation of type 1 of the compact continuum  $M$  is itself a continuum with no continuum of condensation, then it is an essential continuum of condensation of  $M$  in the present sense.

It is easy to see that there exists a compact continuum  $M$  containing a continuum  $K$  which is an essential continuum of condensation of  $M$  of type 2 in the sense of P.S.T. but which does not contain more than one point of any continuum of condensation of  $M$ . However, by Theorem 8, if the compact and webless continuum  $M$  has an "essential continuum of condensation of type 2," then it has an essential continuum of condensation in the present sense.

**THEOREM 9.** *If  $M$  is a compact continuum such that every non-degenerate subcontinuum of  $M$  contains uncountably many local separating points† of  $M$ ,*

\* Cf. R. L. Moore, *Fundamental Theorems of Point Set Theory*, The Rice Institute Pamphlet, vol. XXIII (1936), p. 58. The word "non-degenerate" is to be omitted in the statement of Axiom 2 on p. 3.

† A point  $P$  is a *local separating point* of  $M$  provided some neighborhood  $V$  of  $P$  exists such that  $M \cdot \bar{V} - P$  is separated between some pair of points belonging to the component of  $M \cdot \bar{V}$  which contains  $P$ . See G. T. Whyburn, *Local separating points of continua*, Monatshefte für Mathematik und Physik, vol. 36 (1929), p. 305, and *Sets of local separating points of a continuum*, Bulletin of the American Mathematical Society, vol. 39 (1933), p. 97.

and  $H$  and  $K$  are two mutually exclusive closed subsets of  $M$ , then there do not exist infinitely many mutually exclusive subcontinua of  $M$  each containing both a point of  $H$  and a point of  $K$ .

**Proof.** Suppose there exists an infinite sequence  $\alpha$  of mutually exclusive subcontinua of  $M$  each intersecting both  $H$  and  $K$ . There exists a subsequence  $\beta$  of  $\alpha$  converging to some continuum  $L$  that intersects both  $H$  and  $K$ . There exists a non-degenerate subcontinuum  $T$  of  $L$  containing no point of  $H+K$ . By hypothesis  $L$  contains an uncountable set  $Q$  of local separating points of  $M$  belonging to  $T$ . By a theorem of Whyburn's,\* there exists a point  $P$  of  $Q$  of Menger order† 2 of  $M$ . There exists a domain  $D$  with respect to  $M$  containing  $P$  such that  $\bar{D}$  contains no point of  $H$  or of  $K$  and such that  $\gamma$ , the boundary of  $D$  with respect to  $M$ , consists of only two points. Since  $P$  belongs to the sequential limiting set of  $\beta$ , infinitely many continua of  $\beta$  contain points of  $D$ . But each of them contains points belonging to  $H+K$  and therefore to  $S-D$ . Hence each of them intersects  $\gamma$ . But the continua of  $\beta$  are mutually exclusive and  $\gamma$  is a finite point set. This involves a contradiction.

**THEOREM 10.** *If  $AB$  is an arc lying in the compact continuum  $M$  and containing uncountably many local separating points of  $M$ , then there exists an open subset  $D$  of  $M$  containing  $AB$  such that there are uncountably many points each separating  $A$  from  $B$  in  $\bar{D}$ .*

**Proof.** By the above mentioned theorem of Whyburn's there exists an uncountable subset  $K$  of  $AB - (A+B)$  such that every point of  $K$  is of Menger order 2 of  $M$ . Suppose  $P$  is a point of  $K$ . There exists an open subset  $I_P$  of  $M$  containing  $P$  such that (1)  $I_P$  contains neither  $A$  nor  $B$ , (2) the boundary of  $I_P$  consists of two points, (3)  $I_P - P$  is the sum of two connected and mutually separated point sets containing  $A_P$  and  $B_P$  respectively of the boundary, with respect to  $M$ , of  $I_P$  such that  $A_P$  lies between  $A$  and  $P$ , and  $B_P$  lies between  $B$  and  $P$ , on the arc  $AB$ . There exist open subsets  $H_{AP}$  and  $H_{BP}$  of  $M$  containing  $AA_P$  and  $BB_P$  respectively and such that  $\bar{H}_{AP}$  and  $\bar{H}_{BP}$  are mutually exclusive. The point set  $H_{AP} + I_P + H_{BP}$  is an open subset  $T_P$  of  $M$  containing  $AB$ , and  $P$  separates  $A$  from  $B$  in  $T_P$ .

There exists a sequence  $D_1, D_2, D_3, \dots$  of open subsets of  $M$  closing down on  $AB$ . For each point  $P$  of  $K$  there exists a number  $n_P$  such that  $\bar{D}_{n_P}$  is a subset of  $T_P$ . The point set  $K$  is uncountable. Hence there exist a number  $m$  and an uncountable subset  $L$  of  $K$  such that, if  $P$  is any point whatsoever

\* G. T. Whyburn, *Concerning the cut points of continua*, these Transactions, vol. 30 (1928), p. 606.

† Cf. K. Menger, *Grundzüge einer Theorie der Kurven*, Mathematische Annalen, vol. 95 (1925), pp. 272-306.

of  $L$ ,  $n_P = m$ . For every point  $P$  of  $L$ ,  $\bar{D}_m$  is a subset of  $T_P$  and therefore  $P$  separates  $A$  from  $B$  in  $D_m$ .

**THEOREM 11.** *If every non-degenerate subcontinuum of the compact continuum  $M$  contains uncountably many local separating points of  $M$ , then  $M$  has no essential continuum of condensation.*

**Proof.** Suppose  $K$  is a non-degenerate subcontinuum of  $M$ . By Theorem 9, and Theorem 8 of Chapter 2 of P.S.T., every subcontinuum of  $M$  is a continuous curve. Hence  $K$  contains an arc  $AB$ . By Theorem 10 there exists a domain  $D$ , with respect to  $M$ , containing  $AB$  and such that there are uncountably many points each separating  $A$  from  $B$  in  $D$ . Let  $N$  denote the set of all points that separate  $A$  from  $B$  in  $D$ . The point set  $N$  contains a perfect set.\* Hence it contains a perfect point set  $H$  having no non-degenerate component. Let  $Q$  denote the set of all subcontinua  $q$  of  $AB$  such that (1)  $q$  does not contain more than two points of  $H$ , but (2) every subcontinuum of  $AB$  of which  $q$  is a proper subset contains more than two points of  $H$ . Let  $W$  denote the set of all components  $x$  of  $M - AB$  such that there are at least two continua of the set  $Q$  each containing a limit point of  $x$ . Each point set of the set  $W$  contains at least one point of  $M - D$ . Hence, by Theorem 9,  $W$  is a finite set. Furthermore if  $x$  is a point set of the set  $W$ , there do not exist infinitely many continua of the set  $Q$  each containing a limit point of  $x$ . Hence if  $L$  denotes the set of all continua  $q$  of  $Q$  such that  $q$  contains a limit point of some point set of the set  $W$ , the set  $L$  is finite. Hence there exist two points  $E$  and  $F$  such that (1)  $E$  and  $F$  are both continua of the set  $Q$ , and (2) the interval  $EF$  of  $AB$  contains no limit point of any point set of the set  $W$ . Let  $T$  denote the set of all continua of the set  $Q$  which are subsets of  $EF$ . For each continuum  $t$  of the set  $T$ , let  $g_t$  denote the component of  $M - (EF - t)$  that contains  $t$ . Let  $G_1$  denote the set of all continua  $g_t$  for all continua  $t$  of the set  $T$  except  $E$  and  $F$ . If  $\bar{g}_E + \bar{g}_F$  is not a continuum, let  $G$  denote the collection whose elements are  $g_E, g_F$  and the elements of  $G_1$ . If  $\bar{g}_E + \bar{g}_F$  is a continuum  $C$ , let  $G$  denote the collection whose elements are  $C$  and the elements of  $G_1$ . In the first case  $G$  is an arc, and in the second case it is a simple closed curve, with respect to its elements. In neither case does any continuum of  $G$  contain the continuum  $K$ . Hence  $M$  has no essential continuum of condensation.

**THEOREM 12.** *If the compact and webless continuum  $M$  has no essential continuum of condensation, then every non-degenerate subcontinuum of  $M$  contains uncountably many local separating points of  $M$ .*

**Proof.** Suppose  $K$  is a non-degenerate subcontinuum of  $M$ . By hypothesis

\* G. T. Whyburn, *Cut points of connected sets and of continua*, these Transactions, vol. 32 (1930), p. 151.

and Theorem 2 there exists a collection  $G$  of class 1 filling up  $M$  and such that no continuum of the collection  $G$  contains  $K$ . Let  $H$  denote the collection of all the continua of  $G$  that intersect  $K$ . There exists a free segment  $t$  with respect to  $G$  whose elements belong to  $H$ . But there exists no uncountable set of mutually exclusive non-degenerate subcontinua of  $M$ . Hence uncountably many of the elements of  $t$  are points of  $K$ . But clearly every point of  $K$  which is an element of  $t$  is a local separating point of  $M$ .

Theorem 12 does not remain true on the omission from its hypothesis of the requirement that  $M$  be webless. For a plane continuum consisting of a square together with its interior has no essential continuum of condensation and no one of its points separates it locally.

Neither is it true that if the subcontinuum  $K$  of the compact and webless continuum  $M$  contains no essential continuum of condensation of  $M$ , then  $K$  contains uncountably many local separating points of  $M$ . Consider the following example.

EXAMPLE. In a Cartesian plane  $S$  let  $OX$  and  $OY$  denote the axes of coordinates. If  $h$  is a positive number and  $E$  and  $F$  are points of  $OX$  such that  $x_E$ , the abscissa of  $E$ , is less than  $x_F$ , the abscissa of  $F$ , then by the *R-set of altitude  $h$  whose base is  $EF$*  will be meant the continuous curve  $M$  described in Example 2 on page 347 of P.S.T. except that  $A$ ,  $B$ ,  $A'$ , and  $B'$  denote  $(x_E, h)$ ,  $(x_F, h)$ ,  $E$ , and  $F$ , respectively, instead of  $(0, 1)$ ,  $(1, 1)$ ,  $(0, 0)$ , and the point which was erroneously labelled  $(0, 1)$  instead of  $(1, 0)$  in the first sentence of the description of Example 1 on page 346. In accordance with this new meaning of the letters  $A$ ,  $B$ ,  $A'$ , and  $B'$ ,  $A'_1 B'_1$ ,  $A'_2 B'_2$ ,  $A'_3 B'_3$ ,  $\dots$  of course denote subintervals of  $EF$ . For each  $n$ , the interval  $A'_n B'_n$  will be called the  $n$ th Cantor interval associated with the *R-set of altitude  $h$  whose base is  $EF$* .

Let  $M_1$  denote the *R-set of altitude 1 whose base is the interval whose endpoints are  $(0, 0)$  and  $(1, 0)$* . For each  $n$ , let  $r_{1n}$  denote the  $n$ th Cantor interval associated with  $M_1$ , and let  $M_{1n}$  denote the *R-set of altitude  $1/(n+2)$  whose base is  $r_{1n}$* . Let  $W_1$  denote the collection of *R-sets*  $M_{11}$ ,  $M_{12}$ ,  $M_{13}$ ,  $\dots$ . For each  $m$ , let  $M_{1nm}$  denote the *R-set of altitude  $1/(n+2)(m+2)$  whose base is the  $m$ th Cantor interval associated with  $M_{1n}$* . Let  $W_2$  denote the collection of all *R-sets*  $M_{1nm}$  for all sensed pairs of positive integers  $n$  and  $m$ . This process may be continued indefinitely. Thus there exists an infinite sequence  $W_1, W_2, W_3, \dots$  such that (1) for each  $k$ ,  $W_k$  is the collection of all *R-sets*  $M_{1n_1 n_2 \dots n_k}$  for all sensed sets of  $k$  positive integers  $n_1, n_2, \dots, n_k$ , (2) for each  $k$ , and sensed set of  $k$  positive integers  $n_1, n_2, n_3, \dots, n_k$ ,  $M_{1n_1 n_2 n_3 \dots n_k n_{k+1}}$  is the *R-set of altitude  $1/(n_1+2)(n_2+2) \dots (n_{k+1}+2)$  whose base is the  $(n_k+1)$ th Cantor interval associated with  $M_{1n_1 n_2 \dots n_k}$* , (3) for each  $n$ ,  $M_{1n}$  is as described above.



Let  $M$  denote the point set which is the sum of  $M_1$  and all the  $R$ -sets of the collections  $W_1, W_2, W_3, \dots$ . Let  $K$  denote the straight line interval whose extremities are  $(0, 0)$  and  $(1, 0)$ . The continuum  $K$  contains no local separating point of  $M$ . Nevertheless, though it is a continuum of condensation of  $M$ , it contains no essential continuum of condensation of  $M$ .

**THEOREM 13.** *If  $M$  is a compact continuum and  $W$  is a set of collections of class 1 each filling up  $M$ , and  $G$  is the collection of all continua  $g$  such that, for some point  $P$  of  $M$ ,  $g$  is the component containing  $P$  of the common part of all continua  $x$  such that  $x$  contains  $P$  and belongs to some collection of the set  $W$ , then  $G$  is itself a collection of class 1.*

**Proof.** The collection  $G$  is an upper semi-continuous collection of mutually exclusive continua. Suppose there exists a continuum  $K$  of elements of  $G$  which is an essential continuum of condensation of  $G$ . There exists a collection  $Q$  of the set  $W$  such that no continuum of the collection  $Q$  contains every continuum of the set  $K$ . For each continuum  $q$  of the collection  $Q$  let  $t_q$  denote the set of all continua of  $G$  which are subsets of  $q$ . Each set  $t_q$  is a continuum of elements of  $G$  and the collection of all sets  $t_q$  for all continua  $q$  of the collection  $Q$  is an upper semi-continuous collection  $T$  of mutually exclusive continua of elements of  $G$ . But, with respect to its elements,  $T$  is a continuum with no continuum of condensation and  $K$  is not a subset of any set of the collection  $T$ . This involves a contradiction. Hence  $G$  belongs to class 1.

With the help of Theorem 13 the following theorem may be easily established.

**THEOREM 14.** *If  $Q$  is the collection of all continua that have no essential continua of condensation, then every compact continuum has  $Q$ -atomic\* subsets.*

**DEFINITION.**† The continuum  $M$  is said to have *property N* if for every positive number  $\epsilon$  there exists a finite set  $G$  of mutually exclusive non-degenerate subcontinua of  $M$  such that every subcontinuum of  $M$  of diameter greater than  $\epsilon$  contains some continuum of the set  $G$ .

**THEOREM 15.** *If a compact continuum has property N, it is a regular curve.*

**Proof.** Suppose  $M$  is a compact continuum with property  $N$ . It is clear

\* If  $M$  is a continuum and  $Q$  is a topological collection of continua, then the subcontinuum  $K$  of  $M$  is said to be a  $Q$ -atomic subset of  $M$  provided there exists an upper semi-continuous collection  $G$  of mutually exclusive continua filling up  $M$  such that, with respect to its elements,  $G$  belongs to  $Q$  and such that (1)  $K$  is an element of  $G$  and (2) if  $H$  is any other upper semi-continuous collection of mutually exclusive continua filling up  $M$  such that  $H$  is, with respect to its elements, a continuum of the collection  $Q$ , then every continuum of the collection  $G$  is a subset of some continuum of the collection  $H$ , or in other words, each continuum of  $H$  is either an element of  $G$  or the sum of two or more elements of  $G$ . (Cf. The Rice Institute Pamphlet, loc. cit.)

† The Rice Institute Pamphlet, loc. cit.

that there do not exist a positive number  $d$  and infinitely many mutually exclusive subcontinua of  $M$  all of diameter greater than  $d$ . Hence  $M$  is a continuous curve. Suppose  $A$  and  $B$  are two distinct points of  $M$ . There exists a finite set  $H$  of mutually exclusive non-degenerate subcontinua of  $M$  such that every subcontinuum of  $M$  of diameter greater than one half the distance from  $A$  to  $B$  contains some continuum of the set  $H$ . There exists a finite point set  $T$  such that each continuum of the set  $H$  contains only one point of  $T$  and each point of  $T$  belongs to some continuum of the set  $H$  and is distinct from  $A$  and from  $B$ . Every subcontinuum of  $M$  that contains  $A$  and  $B$  contains some continuum of the set  $H$  and therefore some point of  $T$ . Hence, since  $M$  is a continuous curve,  $T$  separates  $A$  from  $B$  in  $M$ . Therefore  $M$  is a regular curve.

**THEOREM 16.** *In order that the regular curve  $M$  should fail to have property  $N$  it is necessary and sufficient that it should contain an arc  $AB$  such that every segment of  $AB$  contains an endpoint of an arc in  $M$  which has only its endpoints in common with  $AB$ .*

**Proof.** That this condition is sufficient was shown in The Rice Institute Pamphlet. The necessity will now be shown. Suppose the regular curve  $M$  does not have property  $N$ . Then there exists a positive number  $e$  such that if  $H$  is any finite set of mutually exclusive non-degenerate subcontinua of  $M$ , there exists a subcontinuum of  $M$  with diameter more than  $e$  but containing no continuum of the set  $H$ . There exists, in  $M$ , an arc  $A_1B_1$  of diameter greater than  $e$ . There exists a finite set  $H_1$  of mutually exclusive intervals of  $A_1B_1$  such that every interval of  $A_1B_1$  of diameter more than 1 contains an arc of the set  $H_1$ . There exists in  $M$  an arc  $A_2B_2$  of diameter more than  $e$  and containing no arc of the set  $H_1$ . There exists a set  $H_2$  of mutually exclusive intervals of  $A_2B_2$  such that every interval of  $A_2B_2$  of diameter more than  $1/2$  contains an arc of the set  $H_2$ . Let  $K$  denote the set of all arcs of the set  $H_2$  which are not subsets of any arc of the set  $H_1$ . For each arc  $k$  of the set  $K$  there exists an interval  $h_k$  of  $k$  intersecting no arc of the set  $H_1$ . Let  $K'$  denote the set of all arcs  $h_k$  for all arcs  $k$  of the set  $K$ , and let  $T_1$  denote the set of all arcs of  $H_1$  which contain no arc of  $H_2$ . Let  $H'_2$  denote the set  $T_1 + (H_2 - K) + K'$ . The set  $H'_2$  is a finite set of mutually exclusive arcs. Hence there exists in  $M$  an arc  $A_3B_3$  of diameter more than  $e$  and containing no arc of the set  $H'_2$ . The arc  $A_3B_3$  contains no arc either of the set  $H_1$  or of the set  $H_2$ . This process may be continued indefinitely. It follows that there exist two infinite sequences  $A_1B_1, A_2B_2, \dots$  and  $H_1, H_2, \dots$  such that, for each  $n$ , (1)  $A_nB_n$  is an arc, of diameter more than  $e$ , lying in  $M$ , (2)  $H_n$  is a finite set of mutually exclusive intervals of  $A_nB_n$  such that every interval of  $A_nB_n$  of length more than  $1/n$  contains an interval of the set  $H_n$ , (3) the arc  $A_{n+1}B_{n+1}$  contains no in-

terval of any one of the sets  $H_1, H_2, \dots, H_n$ . There exists an infinite sequence of positive integers  $n_1, n_2, n_3, \dots$  such that the sequence  $A_{n_1}B_{n_1}, A_{n_2}B_{n_2}, \dots$  has a non-degenerate sequential limiting set  $K$ . Since  $M$  is a regular curve, the continuum  $K$  is a regular curve and therefore it contains an arc  $AB$ . Suppose  $E$  and  $F$  are two points of  $AB$ . There exist points  $E_1, E_2, E_3, E_4, E_5$ , and  $E_6$  lying on  $AB$  in the order  $EE_1E_2E_3E_4E_5E_6F$ . There exist two mutually exclusive connected point sets  $D$  and  $R$  containing  $E_3$  and  $E_6$  respectively and such that (1)  $D$  and  $R$  are both domains with respect to  $M$ , (2)  $D \cdot (AB)$  is a subset of the segment of  $AB$  whose endpoints are  $E_2$  and  $E_4$  and  $R \cdot (AB)$  is a subset of the one whose endpoints are  $E_5$  and  $F$ . There exists a number  $i$  such that  $A_{n_i}B_{n_i}$  contains neither of the intervals  $E_1E_2$  and  $E_4E_5$  of  $AB$  but contains points  $X$  and  $Y$  belonging to  $D$  and  $R$  respectively and distinct from  $E_3$  and  $E_6$  respectively. There exist arcs  $XE_3$  and  $YE_6$  lying in  $D$  and  $R$  respectively. The continuum  $XE_3 + A_{n_i}B_{n_i} + YE_6$  contains an arc  $E_3ZE_6$  with endpoints at  $E_3$  and  $E_6$ . There exist points  $O_1$  and  $O_2$  lying respectively on the segments  $E_1E_2$  and  $E_4E_5$  of  $AB$  and such that  $E_3ZE_6$  contains neither  $O_1$  nor  $O_2$ . Let  $W$  denote the common part of  $E_3ZE_6$  and the point set which is the sum of the intervals  $AO_1$  and  $O_2B$  of  $AB$ . The point set  $W$  is closed and contains  $E_6$ . Hence there is a first point of the set  $W$  in the order from  $E_3$  to  $E_6$  on  $E_3ZE_6$ . Let  $L$  denote this point, and let  $Y$  denote the last point of the interval  $O_1O_2$  of  $AB$  in the order from  $E_3$  to  $L$  on the interval  $E_3L$  of  $E_3ZE_6$ . The interval  $YL$  of  $E_3ZE_6$  is an arc in  $M$  with one endpoint on the segment  $EF$  of  $AB$  and having only its endpoints in common with  $AB$ .

**THEOREM 17.** *If  $AB$  is an arc and, for each positive integer  $n$ ,  $H_n$  is a finite set of points  $X_{1n}, X_{2n}, \dots, X_{m_n n}$  lying on  $AB$  in the order indicated,  $X_{1n}$  and  $X_{m_n n}$  being  $A$  and  $B$  respectively, and  $H_n$  being a subset of  $H_{n+1}$ , and  $Q_n$  is a set of arcs  $X_{1n}Z_{1n}X_{2n}, X_{2n}Z_{2n}X_{3n}, \dots, X_{m_n-1,n}Z_{m_n-1,n}X_{m_n n}$  each having only its endpoints in common with  $AB$ , and every point of  $AB$  is a limit point of the point set obtained by adding together all the arcs of the sets  $Q_1, Q_2, Q_3, \dots$  and  $M$  is a regular curve containing that point set, then  $AB$  is an essential continuum of condensation of  $M$ .*

Theorem 17 may be established by an argument similar to that employed on pages 61 and 62 of vol. XXIII of The Rice Institute Pamphlet to prove that a certain straight line interval  $AB$  is an essential continuum of condensation of a certain continuum  $M$ .

**THEOREM 18.** *If the compact and webless continuum  $M$  does not have property  $N$ , there exists an upper semi-continuous collection  $G$  of mutually exclusive continua filling up  $M$  such that, with respect to its elements,  $G$  is a continuum with an essential continuum of condensation.*

**Proof.** Suppose  $M$  has no essential continuum of condensation. Then, by Theorem 36 of Chapter V of P.S.T., it is a regular curve. Hence, by Theorem 16 of this paper and Theorem 7 of page 67 of vol. XXIII of The Rice Institute Pamphlet, there exists an arc  $AB$  lying in  $M$  such that if  $t$  is any segment of  $AB$  and  $K$  is a closed subset of  $M - t$ , there is an arc lying in  $M$  and having in common with  $AB$  only its endpoints which belong to  $t$ . It easily follows that there exist two infinite sequences  $H_1, H_2, H_3, \dots$  and  $Q_1, Q_2, Q_3, \dots$  such that, for each  $n$ , (1)  $H_n$  is a set of  $2^n$  points  $X_{1n}, X_{2n}, \dots, X_{2^n, n}$  lying on  $AB$  in the order indicated, (2) for each odd number  $i$  less than  $2^n$  there are only four points of the set  $H_{n+1}$  between the points  $X_{in}$  and  $X_{i+1, n}$  of the set  $H_n$ , (3)  $Q_n$  is a set of arcs  $X_{1n}Z_{1n}X_{2n}, X_{3n}Z_{2n}X_{4n}, X_{5n}Z_{3n}X_{6n}, \dots, X_{2^n-1, n}Z_{2^n-1, n}X_{2^n, n}$  each lying in  $M$  and having only its endpoints in common with  $AB$  and each of diameter less than  $1/n$ . For each  $n$ , let  $I_n$  denote the set of all points  $X$  such that  $X$  lies on  $AB$  between the endpoints of some arc of the set  $H_n$ . The set  $I_n$  is the sum of  $2^{n-1}$  segments of  $AB$  and  $I_{n+1}$  is a subset of  $I_n$ . Let  $T$  denote the common part of all the point sets of the infinite sequence  $I_1, I_2, I_3, \dots$ . The point set  $T$  is closed, totally disconnected, and uncountable. For each point  $P$  of  $AB - T$ , let  $k_P$  denote the component of  $AB - T$  that contains  $P$ . Let  $K$  denote the set of all the point sets  $k_P$  for all points  $P$  of  $AB - T$ . Let  $G$  denote the collection whose elements are the continua of the collection  $K$  and the points of  $M$  that belong to no continuum of the collection  $K$ . Let  $L$  denote the collection whose elements are the continua of  $G$  which are subsets of the arc  $AB$  and, for each  $n$  and  $i$  ( $i \leq 2^n$ ), let  $X'_{in}$  denote the continuum of the collection  $G$  that contains  $X_{in}$ . For each  $n$  and odd number  $i$  less than  $2^n$ , let  $X'_{in}Z_{in}X'_{i+1, n}$  denote the set whose elements are  $X'_{in}, X'_{i+1, n}$  and the points of  $X_{in}Z_{in}X_{i+1, n}$  which do not belong to  $AB$ . For each  $n$ , let  $H'_n$  denote the collection whose elements are  $X'_{1n}, X'_{2n}, \dots, X'_{2^n, n}$  and let  $Q'_n$  denote the collection whose elements are  $X'_{1n}Z_{1n}X'_{2n}, X'_{3n}Z_{2n}X'_{4n}, \dots, X'_{2^n-1, n}Z_{2^n-1, n}X'_{2^n, n}$ . Let  $A'$  and  $B'$  denote the continua of  $G$  that contain  $A$  and  $B$  respectively. In the space whose "points" are the elements of  $G$ , (1)  $L$  is an arc  $A'B'$  with endpoints at  $A'$  and  $B'$ , (2) for each  $n$ ,  $H'_n$  is a set of points  $X'_{1n}, X'_{2n}, \dots, X'_{2^n, n}$  lying on  $A'B'$  in the order indicated,  $X'_{1n}$  and  $X'_{2^n, n}$  being  $A'$  and  $B'$  respectively, (3)  $H'_n$  is a subset of  $H'_{n+1}$ , (4)  $Q'_n$  is a collection of arcs each having only its endpoints in common with  $A'B'$  and, finally,  $G$  is a regular curve and each point of  $A'B'$  is a limit point of the point set  $H'_1 + H'_2 + H'_3 + \dots$ . It follows, by Theorem 17, that  $A'B'$  is an essential continuum of condensation of  $G$ .

THE UNIVERSITY OF TEXAS,  
AUSTIN, TEXAS